MULTIPART MUSIC
A SPECIFIC MODE OF MUSICAL THINKING, EXPRESSIVE BEHAVIOUR AND SOUND
Contents

Ignazio Macchiarella, Theorizing on multipart music making 7

Enrique Camara de Landa, Multipart music making between Spain and Latin America: some considerations related to the theoretical proposals of Ignazio Macchiarella 23

Historical Perspectives

Gerda Lechleitner & Nona Lomidze, Early sound documents of multipart music. Concepts and historical context, analysis and interpretation 37

Susanne Ziegler, Multipart music practices in historical perspective. Recording versus notation 51

Rossana Dalmonente, "As once and even more today: music has to be involved in people and God". Liszt’s sacred music for extra-liturgical occasions 67

Vasco Zara, Ad infinitum. Polyphonic practices and theological discussions in Ars Nova’s time 77

Massimo Privitera, The polyphony as an emblem of concorde in early modern Europe 95

Theory and Concepts

Hugo Ferran, The concepts of “part” and “multipart music” for the Maale of southern Ethiopia 105

Zanna Pártas, Musical thinking and sonic realization in vocal heterophony. The case of the wedding songs of the Russian-Belarussian borderland tradition 129

Jacques Bouët, Heterophony leads necessarily to a polyphony much less rudimentary than the bucket. Listening to recordings of Macedo-Romanian (Gramob盆地es of Romanian Dobrogea) and Xhosa (South Africa) plurivocal songs 143

Joseph Jordania, Social factor in traditional polyphony. Definition, creation, and performance 149

Making Multipart Musics: Case Studies

Mauro Balma, Styles of chant and styles of life. Synchronous changes in Cogne, a village in the Western Alps (Italy) 163

Josko Čaleta, Ojkanje, the (multipart) musical system of the Dalmatian Hinterland. The social and emotional dimensions of the performance practices 175

Fulvia Caruso, Multipart singing in Latera: musical behaviour and sense of belonging 187

Daiva Račiūnaitė-Vyčienienė, Specific features of performing Lithuanian polyphonic songs. Sutartines: singing as birdsong 215

Eno Koço, Styles of the iso-based multipart unaccompanied singing (IMUS) of south Albania and north Epirus and among the Arbëresh of Italy 237

Giuseppe Massimo Rizzo, Sopila circular interactions 279

Girolamo Garofalo, Traces of ison and biphonies in the Byzantine chant of Sicilian Arbëresh 301

Joao de Carvalho, Triads, trials and triangles. Harmony singing, mobility and social structure in Mozambique 323

Gerald Florian Messner, The reciprocity of multipart vocal traditions and socio-cultural structures 333

Pyrenees an emerging field

Philippe Cauguilhem, The polyphonic performance of plainchant between history and ethnomusicology 341

Jean Jacques Casteret, Western Pyrenean multipart. A trans-historical approach 347

Jaume Ayats, The lyrical rhythm that orders the world. How the rhythmic built the ritual space models in the religious chants of the Pyrenees 367

Jean-Christophe Maillard, Religious traditional multipart singing in the central Pyrenees 381

Iris Gayete, Time logic of the "vespers" of the Pyrenees 393

Multipart Singing in Sardinia

Sebastiano Pilosu, Canto a tenore and "visibility". Comparing two communities, Orzosolo and Bortigali 403

Marco Lutzu, Rediscovering a multipart tradition. The case of Nughedu San Nicòlo 415

Roberto Milleddu, "Cal'est su giustu" (what’s the right thing?). Notes on multipart singing in Bosa (Sardinia) 427

Paolo Bravi, The practice of ornamentation in the multipart vocal music of southern Sardinia. A ‘bifocal’ perspective in ethnomusicalological analysis 439

References 463
Multipart music making between Spain and Latin America:
some considerations related to the theoretical proposals of Ignazio
Macchiarella

Enrique Cámara de Landa

Introduction
Introduction

The illuminating paper written by Ignazio Macchiarella as a theoretical frame for the First Meeting of the ICTM Study Group on Multipart Music not only constituted a consistent answer to the invitation made by the chair of the group, Ardian Ahmedaja, to "extend our views on multipart music traditions worldwide, by means of research, documentation, interdisciplinary and cross-cultural study,"¹ but it also contained a high degree of heuristic value, since its statements and proposals stimulated many reflections on the specificities of this kind of musical behaviour and its many challenges to ethnomusicological theory. Even if I have never studied orally transmitted multipart music in detail, I should like to propose some considerations related both to the ideas launched by Macchiarella in this paper and to some musical traditions in Spanish-speaking countries that could be considered as multipart repertoires or genres. First of all, I shall present the musical cases and then I will try to connect their observation to Macchiarella's ideas.

Some Genres and repertoires

To my knowledge, there are only two monographic musicological publications on repertoires and genres of orally transmitted multipart music to be found today in Spain: an article written by Jaume Ayats and Silvia Martínez (2008),² and a book published by Miguel Ángel Berlanga (2009) with a group of young researchers under his direction. The musical practices studied by Martínez and Ayats are alive on the Spanish Mediterranean coast, in the Balearic Islands, the Basque Country, Navarra, and Cádiz. Berlanga's work deals with the religious repertory song from different places in Andalucía during Holy Week (Miserere and Stabat Mater being the most relevant, but not the only ones: Via Crucis, romances, pregones, and saetas are some of the others).

Two remarks should be made before going further. The first is that neither these scholars nor I have focused on the practice of singing in parallel thirds, which is to be found throughout the country and in Latin America too (even if this interval is often present in the traditions studied). The second one regards the fact that they have only focused on polyphonies produced exclusively by voices. I will mostly do the same, with one exception: in the second part of this text I will say a few words about some heterophonic and polyphonic musical genres in Spain which are produced with voices and musical instruments together.

As a general rule, we do not find orally transmitted multipart vocal music in Spanish

¹ See the chronicle of the Study Group on Multipart Music in http://www.multipartmusic.org/multipartmusic/node/7

² Other references are quoted in this text: an article from Ayats on heterophony in the Spanish region of Osona, the annotations made by Vicent Torrent and Josemi Sánchez to some sound anthologies which contain the Cant de l'aurora musical genre, and those made by Manuel García Matos to a large sound anthology of traditional music in Spain.
speaking countries of Latin America, except for two musical and literary genres: one is the Venezuelan-Colombian tono de velorio and the other is the Mexican canción cardenche. The tono de velorio is practised in some regions of Venezuela and the plains of Colombia, and is constituted by three main subgenres: velorios de muertos (vigil for the deceased) velorios de angélicos (vigil for children) and velorios de santos (vigil for Saints).

The main motivation for organizing tonos de velorio is "keeping a promise" to a Saint for having received a favour. This event takes place through meetings in which people keep singing and dancing the whole night long. The tonos de velorio are performed in three parts a cappella or with the accompaniment of a pair of shaken idiophones called maracas and one of the following instruments: a little guitar called cuatro (because it has four strings), a bandola, and a six string guitar. Since it starts the song and plays the role of leader, the intermediate voice of the three part polyphony is called guía -the Spanish word for "guide" or alante (which in Spanish means "in front of"). After the guía begins the song, next to start is the person who sings the second part -called falsa, contralto or media falsa- who produces the highest pitch sounds. The last part in the order of appearance is the inferior, tenor or tenorete, singing the lowest sounds.

I shall not go into detail here on the way these parts function in the tonos de velorio, since they have been studied by the Argentine ethnomusicologist Isabel Aretz and her husband, the Venezuelan Luis Felipe Ramón y Rivera. The recordings they made of this genre are kept in the FUNDEF Sound Archives (Fundación de Etnomusicología y Folklore), once called INIDEF (Instituto Interamericano de Etnomusicología y Folklore) and located in Caracas. Today, the Venezuelan María Teresa Hernández Escalona is carrying out research on the cantaúria (one of the names given to the meetings for singing tonos de velorio in some of her country's regions) for her PhD thesis to be defended at the University of Valladolid. Since the expression canción cardenche is composed of the Spanish words canción ("song") and cardenche (a kind of plant which has many thorns), performers refer to its name as a metaphor for a song that, after being heard for the first time, "penetrates into your body and into your soul in such a way that nothing will ever be able to take it away from you anymore". Canción cardenche also receives the names of canción de basurero -"song of the dump"-, since it was sometimes sung close to these places, and canción de borrachitos -"songs of drunkards"-, since alcohol is consumed during these performances. Today, canción cardenche is practiced in the Mexican region of La Laguna (in the states of Durango and Coahuila) and is said to be in the throes of disappearing. It is performed a cappella by men singing in three -sometimes four- parts (here once again we find one person for each part). We have news of this type of song from the end of the Nineteenth century onwards. People use canto cardenche for singing about the strain of working in bad

3 The Argentine musicologist Elena Hermo told me that she recorded Tonos de Velorio during her fieldwork in the area.

4 Montserrat Palacios, personal communication.
Figure 1 - Musical transcription of a *tono de velorio* made by Luis Felipe Ramón y Rivera and published in his book *La Música folklórica de Venezuela* (1969, Caracas, Monte Avila).
conditions, injustice, and other themes (not always sad, sometimes happy). The three voices have specific names:
- Primera or fundamental, performed by the leader of the group (who is the only one who needs to know the whole repertoire of texts),
- Primera de arrastre (which means the first who drags) or marrana (“female pig”), singing in low sounds and providing the grounding for the others, and
- Contraltra or requinto, who sings in a very high register, with their tensed throat muscles expressing the dramatic content of the song.

The scholars who have studied the canción cardenche point out the relevance of the singers’ personal emotional engagement in this genre, and the importance of the production of silence for expressive goals: very long and unexpected pauses in the musical discourse are present here. The canción cardenche has been described by Thomas Stanford and is now being studied by Montserrat Palacios from Mexico, who has started to

Figure 2 - Musical transcription of the Canción cardenche Ojitos negros made by Montserrat Palacios and included in her PhD thesis (in preparation).
work on her PhD thesis at the University of Valladolid (see figure 2).\(^5\)
Both the *tono de velorio* and the *canción cardenche* are characterized by the simultaneous singing of more than one melody. Further research will probably complete this first survey of orally transmitted multi-part singing in Latin American speaking countries.

Some considerations

The idea of proposing “Multipart music as a specific mode of musical thinking, expressive behavior and sound” as a title for the symposium in Sardinia reminds us that, just as for every kind of musical phenomenon, multipart music can be regarded from a triple perspective: as an object, as a process, and as a consideration.\(^6\) The third element—considerations—will occupy this second part of the present text. If we decide to follow Macchiarella’s proposal regarding the possibility of including the cases of multipart music—or polyphony—produced simultaneously by voices and musical instruments within our observation domain, we shall see how the range of possibilities and cases grow. Since in Spanish speaking countries, many genres and repertoires are performed by producing “mixed polyphony” (vocal and instrumental together), it would be not possible—or even pertinent— to give detailed descriptions here. Instead, I find it more suitable, for an introductory text like this, to consider some general cases. The first one is that in which a person sings one melody and simultaneously produces a variation of it on a musical instrument (i.e. the rabel in Cantabria and the North of Castile, which is mostly played by men, even if nowadays some women are starting to perform with this rubbed chordophone).\(^7\)

From the point of view of communicative behaviour (or the “communicative intention”), we could consider this kind of performance as a case of self-communication (if he or she is singing and playing alone), or as a communication to others (if there is someone listening to him or her). This alternative reminds us that sometimes the listener is exclusively the performer, so the two components of the musical event (performer-listener) are in coincidence. I wonder whether it would be pertinent to consider the heterophony produced by the same person singing and playing the rabel as a case of polyphony, as this could be the case for many other similar cases of musical performance. This situation was excluded from Macchiarella’s consideration of multi-

---

5 Some short examples of *Cancion cardenche* can be heard in the video documentary on Internet (www.youtube.com/watch?v=IqOhTcyXV8A), last consultation: 28 august 2011.

6 See Cámara de Landa 2002 for the application of this triple perspective to the phenomenon of hybridization in music.

7 The musical transcription included here has been taken from the PhD defended by Susana Moreno at the University of Valladolid and published in 2008. Many other examples can be seen in this electronic publication and in Moreno 2011.
part phenomena as the combined action of two or more persons (p. 11), but relating to statements concerning the co-presence of at least two persons (p. 10). We could perhaps consider the case of a single musician simultaneously producing two different sequences of sounds with the intention of doing so—in other words, consciously—and through the application of some music behavioural rules. This inclusion should derive in a reformulation of the last part of this statement: “So, the minimum condition of multipart music is the co-presence of at least two persons producing deliberately dissimilar but coordinate sound sequences on the basis of shared rules” (see p. 10), since we would be considering the mixed polyphony produced by only one person. This is a different situation from that tackled by Macchiarella in his consideration on the unintentional heterophony produced by “fortuitous overlapping” between two or more
persons (p. 10). Of course, everyone can notice the difference between polyphonic -or multipart- music as a music produced by one person with a polyphonic instrument on one side and that produced by two or more persons singing or playing on the other one. From the social and behavioural point of view, the difference exists and it can be relevant; but, if we consider the whole phenomenon (ideas + musical production + behaviour), perhaps we could include both cases in our target group of studies. Furthermore, there are some performance practices that have been considered by scholars as monodic, even if they sometimes include the simultaneous production of different melodic lines. I am thinking, as an example, of the Ronda de coplas and the ronda de bagualas (literary and musical structures sung by a group of persons in a circle in the Northwest of Argentina), a genre which I studied for my PhD thesis many years ago. Even if the participants of these rondas follow the leaders who propose the texts to be sung (a role that can be assumed by everyone in every moment), each one uses a different sequence of pitches, respecting a rhythmic structure which is fixed and is never changed. Frequently, some pitch coincidences are produced at special points of the structure; but in other places of the melody people sing different pitches. This means that different sound sequences are co-present: the participants have the intention of singing "the same thing" as a whole, but they produce a special kind of heterophony which is intentional only in part. Still, this is not the same case pointed out by Macchiarella in his statement regarding football, politics or Catholic meetings (p. 10), since in the rondas, the participants want to sing the same text with the same rhythmic structure but they do not have the intention of singing the same sequence of pitches. They are aware of this rule, and at the same time they consider themselves to be singing the same "tonada" (a polysemic word that in this case indicates an almost regular sequence of pitches). This fact (which perhaps could be partially related to the "participatory discrepancies" pointed out by Charles Keil and Steve Feld - cfr. Keil 1987 - Feld 1988) could be seen as a contradiction by outsiders, but it is an ambivalent phenomenon that carries pertinence from the emic perspective. Even if the triads are not heard in this "clean" way in most of the types of bagualas, the intention of the participants in a ronda is to sing only the three pitches of the tritonic system, as we can see in the transcription in figure 4.

In many places in Latin America, orally transmitted traditional music is often performed by groups of people through the means of coordinating their musical competences in order to produce concrete results. The range of possibilities reaches a large continuum which has at one extreme, the singing of monodies or the performing of parallel homorhythmic polyphonies with the accompaniment of instruments (like the chordophones which play harmonic and rhythmic roles -guitars, harps, charangos and so on-, or some others -violins, trumpets, etc.- producing heterophonies or parallelisms), while at the other, we find different forms of polyphony combined in many

8 Cfr. Cámara de Landa 1999 - in which I include some cases of polyphony in the collective singing of bagualas-, 2001 and 2006.
ways. Let us consider two examples:

The first one is a group of musical genres performed by the sikuris\(^9\) in the Andean areas of Perú and other South-American countries, in which the phenomenon of “thinking horizontally” can be a collective and shared behaviour (for example, when each of the melodies that conform the production of a homorhythmic polyphony is made with a hoquetus technique by the combination of two musicians, each one blowing on a Pan flute that produces only half of the complete musical scale).\(^10\) This way of complementary musical production of a single “melody” could be seen as an example of the situation related as a “growing relational sequence of sounds that exist only in connection with others”: this interesting idea which Macchiarella proposes in his statement on p. 21 should be accepted in its broad sense, since in the case of Cuzco sikuris, the lines are adjusting their binary complementary roles in a flexible way only in part (that is, for some of the instruments which produce the homorhythmic polyphony), while the hoquetus technique adopted for producing each of the melodies requires the respect

---

9 Sikuri is the person who plays the Pan flute called siku in some Andean areas of Perú, Bolivia, Argentina and Chile. The pieces played by groups of sikuris are sometimes called sikureadas.

10 See http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ql8TIAebJ_Y
of rigid codes. The “reality” of music performance very often exceeds the most extreme and subtle theoretical elaborations, and this is the case, since two kinds of musical behaviour are coalescent in the production of a musical piece. Furthermore, even if Macchiarella’s pertinent observation regarding the impossibility felt by the musicians of executing their part correctly in the absence of other parts, could be applicable to this hoquetus technique (not related to the construction of polyphony, but to only one part), the fact that this is produced by instruments goes beyond this limitation, since one musician can put the two parts of a siku together and play the complete melody alternating the blowing on these two rows.¹¹ At the same time, this way of producing music could be considered as a case of intra-cultural communication, since an audience is not necessary in this case of participatory performance (Turino 2008). Here we can refer to Macchiarella’s statement on sound identity (p. 12) and relate it to this case considering the dialectic between searching for and maintaining one’s own distinctiveness and, at the same time, the intention of reaching a sound fusion with the others.

Some other components of this musical practice can be related to different semantic issues, like the performing of pieces that are considered as an emblem of cultural identity, the searching for social ties through the homogeneous unity of musical style produced by participating in binary complementary roles, or the competition between people from different neighborhoods and using the performance of music to express their “feeling of belonging” connected with local-social identity. This was the case of the groups of sikuris who play their Pan flutes during the procession for the Holy Virgin of Punta Corral in Tílocara (in the North-western Argentine province of Jujuy), before the recent initiative—taken by local organizers—of ending these disputes between different places of belonging through the unification of the different ensembles and the forming of “the world’s largest banda de sikuris.”¹²

The second example I wish to quote here is the traditional Venezuelan Christmas song Corre Caballito performed by the Serenata Guayanesa group, since it shows us one of the several cases of cross-cultural communication through the use of mass-media to be found on the Internet.¹³ Here we can consider many aspects, such as the musical structure (in which different forms of multipart production are combined), the new styles derived from the making of arrangements which imitate instrumental polyphony (sometimes blending oral, written and multimedia ways of learning, teaching and producing music), the semantic changes caused when musicians perform on stage (in

¹¹ An example of this technique can be seen in a video placed on YouTube, in which Aníbal Quispe (from the Los Chacras 2 group) plays Guanuqueando, a melody by the Argentine composer Ricardo Vilca, on a two-row siku. http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BSpW43ebXKO, consulted on September 8th 2011.

¹² See: http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=I9OqTuKvFKY, consulted on September 11th 2011.

the open air or in theatres), or in the media (radio, television), and so on. The detailed consideration of these aspects would evoke several kinds of questions that exceed the goal of the proposals made by Macchiarella’s text, and they should be the content of future research. Instead, we could try here to extend the statement on “single melody accompanied by functional chords” (p. 15) to the cases in which a melody is accompanied by an instrument which simultaneously provides the harmony and the rhythmic basis (a double function often assumed in Spanish speaking countries by the strumming of chordophones like the guitar, the *cuatro*, and so on, mainly for the accompaniment of dances). Sometimes (and this is the case of the example quoted here), some of the voices imitate the sound of the instruments with this double function, and this does not prevent real instruments from being played at the same time.

In Spain many musical repertoires of vocal and instrumental polyphony are to be found. As an example, I quote here The *Animeros of Caravaca de la Cruz*, ensembles of musicians who belong to a tradition of religious brotherhoods in the Spanish South-Eastern region (Murcia, Eastern Andalucía and the South-East of Castilla-La Mancha). These groups collected resources for the souls in Purgatory at Christmas time, by playing and singing. After decades of inactivity, a revival was started about 30 years ago throughout South-East Spain, following the model proposed by the main group (*The Animeros of Caravaca*). In his PhD thesis to be defended soon at the University of Valladolid, Julio Guillén proposes the musical transcription and analysis of this instrumental ensemble, conformed by 5 and 6 stringed or double-stringed guitars, bandurrias, lutes, a violin, a tambourine called *pandereta*, cymbals, aerophones like the flute and clarinet... and one person singing melismatic melodies with a harsh-sounding voice. The violin, flute and plucked string instruments perform variations of the sung melody, producing a rich heterophony.

Many other considerations came to my mind when relating Macchiarella’s proposals to the cases of traditional multipart music produced in Spain and Latin America, such as the following ones:

- “Solidarity among the performers” (p. 12): everyone could find many examples, like those of the *comparsas* (groups of musicians performing in Latin American countries during Carnival festivities - see Restelli 2006), *sikuris* and other Andean Pan flute ensembles, *rondas de coplas*, and many other groups and circumstances in which musical activity is related to family, friends, or neighbourhood networks.
- “Centre of music as resonant experience” (p. 21): the sound quality of *cajas* (frame drums with a tense string across one of the skins) performed during a *ronda de coplas* can be considered as a strong and powerful element of resonant musical and individual/social experience (Cámara de Landa 2006).
- In many multipart music genres there are specific roles and hierarchies (p. 13). We could perhaps extend this useful concept to the ensembles which produce multipart music through respecting different vocal and instrumental parts and/or functions: i.e., in the world of *conjuntos folklóricos* -folk music ensembles- in Latin America, where the roles and hierarchies are present in both vocal and instrumen-
Figure 5 - Musical transcription of a malagueña (a musical genre related to the Andalusian fandango) performed by voice, violin and guitar. Guillén, Julio, Los Animeros de Canavaca de la Cruz: Música, ritual, fiesta y revivir en la Sierra de Segura, PhD thesis in preparation.
tal participants, often connected to functions (guitar, main violin, *segundeador*; accordion, harp, trumpet, and so on). The musical function of the guitar, for example, could be the same both in a mariachi and in a South American ensemble, but the musical leadership of the group is not the same: for example, it is often performed by the trumpets in the mariachi and by the violins or the guitar in a *conjunto*. The guitar gives the harmonic-rhythmic base in both cases, but the leadership of musical conduction changes from the mariachi to the *conjunto*.

Another parameter to be considered is the performance of the main musical part: in some ensembles, it is always held by the same person, while in others it can be performed alternatively by all the musicians of the group.

Just two more considerations will put a necessary end to this text (which could still be prolonged, since Macchiarella’s text gives us food for thought and discussion for every case). The first consideration concerns the oral-written relationship: even if in some paradigmatic cases there is a clear difference between the use of written music in some groups and the procedures of oral transmission in some others, this dichotomy is not often useful, since sometimes both are present in the same group. Furthermore, the addition of a third element can be suggested: the multimedia source. It might be useful to remember that sometimes not all the participants of a single musical group use the same kind of source. Conversely, it may sometimes happen that one single participant makes use of more than one source (the reader is invited to find examples of both cases). The second final comment is that, even if the statement on p. 21 can easily be accepted (“each performer has a predictable representation of his own part and a comprehensive image of the frame of combined music production”), this could be applied in a flexible or broad way to some special cases, since in some music genres and repertoires (i.e. those played by *sikuris*) the musician has a comprehensive image of the melody from which he is playing only some notes (remember the hoquetus technique). Once again, the reality of musical performance challenges the theoretical elaborations without invalidating them.

---

14 The musician who plays the “second voice” in a traditional music group.

15 Argentine tubular drum.